| **Student Name:** Andrew Man |
| --- |

| **Motion:** As a developing economy, this house will prioritise trade liberalisation over economic protectionism |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 6 minutes’ long.]  I like that we’re attempting to flip the example given by 1st Prop. But it feels like a drastic refocusing to something that is unrelated, re: unfairness of free trade agreements, instead  On the counter set-up:   * It isn’t clear how Opp is arguing that you can still open up to free trade while proposing protectionism, how is this not a contradiction? * What exactly are the protectionist policies you’re proposing? * How does Opp engineer economic growth in your world? * What’s the winning pathway/burden?   On the lack of accountability mechanism, we are asserting this. Spend time proving why these economic hegemons can strongarm developing nations into unfavourable terms.  On the Belt and Road example, what is it meant to prove? It seems like a floating example of big countries using trade to benefit themselves, but it’s not proving why smaller countries have to agree to these terms if it is not beneficial to them overall.  We are missing engagement to the entirety of Prop’s problem statement on why organic growth is made impossible due to the incapacity of developing states! How does Opp achieve anything?  On local economies not being able to compete with developed economies, try to use a structured way to mechanise the conclusion (which should be stated clearly that you are proving that local industries would be completely decimated).   * The Indian example was correct, but we are using the example in lieu of actual logical reasoning.   + Spend time explaining why there are comparative advantages that MNCs have over local companies, e.g. brand, resources, expertise, etc.   + Then spend time explaining what exactly these common unfavourable terms are that make it impossible for developing nations to come back from.   Don’t say “I hope this is correct,” argue with confidence!  On protecting local sovereignty, we are not completely mechanising why these local governments have no real choice but to listen to these foreign forces.   * We need to explain why the state had to prioritise economic survival over local interests, due to the importance of the working class as a voter bloc and the economic growth being the foremost concern of the developing world. * There’s under-impacting of what the real harm is here.   + Explain the human costs of deregulation.   Andrew, the speech is incredibly unstructured.   * It wasn’t clear where the transition points were, I can’t tell where the set-up, rebuttals, and arguments begin and end.   Please offer more POIs today!  6.16 | | | | | | |